Implications of Genetic Testing for Australian Insurance Law and Practice

Centre for Law and Genetics
Occasional Paper No. 1

University of Tasmania
School of Law

University of Melbourne
Faculty of Law
Implications of Genetic Testing for Australian Insurance Law and Practice

Associate Professor Margaret Otlowski

Centre for Law and Genetics
Occasional Paper No 1

Centre for Law and Genetics
# Table of Contents

Table of Contents ................................................................. iii

Chapter One: Introduction ...................................................... 1
1.1 About this Report ............................................................. 1
1.2 The Nature of Genetic Disorders ......................................... 2
1.3 The Human Genome Project ............................................... 5
1.4 Benefits and Burdens ....................................................... 5

Chapter Two: The Current Position: Australian Law and Practice in Relation to the Use of Genetic Test Information ................................................. 8
2.1 Principles of Insurance ...................................................... 8
2.2 Forms of Insurance and the Need to Distinguish between Life and Health Insurance ......................................................... 9
2.3 The Nature of Insurance Contracts: Contracts of Utmost Good Faith and the Duty of Disclosure ........................................ 13
2.4 Use which can be Currently Made of Genetic Information by Insurers .......................................................... 15
  2.4.1 The Role of Anti-Discrimination Legislation ...................... 16

Chapter Three: Is There a Need for Change? ............................. 24
3.1 The Insurance Industry’s Policy Position with Regard to Genetic Testing ......................................................... 24
3.2 Arguments for Access to Genetic Information ...................... 26
  3.2.1 Adverse Selection Arguments ............................................. 26
  3.2.2 Arguments based on the Availability of Other Genetic Information .......................................................... 31
  3.2.3 Implications of Expansion of Genetic Testing to Diagnose Disease .......................................................... 31
  3.2.4 Insurers Requiring Genetic Testing as a Precondition for Insurance? ......................................................... 32

3.3 Arguments Against Insurers Having Access to Genetic Test Information .......................................................... 34
  3.3.1 Allowing Insurers to Have Access to Genetic Information Will Result in a Decrease in the Availability of Insurance ........................................... 34
  3.3.2 Arguments based on the Unique and Sensitive Nature of Genetic Information ......................................................... 36
  3.3.3 Arguments based on the Limited Predictive Value of Genetic Tests and the Potential for Misinterpretation and Resulting Discrimination ........................................... 37
3.3.4 Concerns that the Use of Genetic Test Information by Insurers May Deter At-Risk Individuals from Undertaking Testing ..........42
3.3.5 Problems in Relation to the Testing of Minors 44
3.3.6 Fear of Genetic Discrimination May Discourage Participation in Research ..........44
Chapter Four: Approaches to Reform ........................................46
4.1 Possible Reform Options ........................................46
4.1.1 Retention of the Status Quo ....................................46
4.1.2 Blanket Prohibition on Access to and/or Use of Genetic Test Information by Insurers ..........47
4.1.3 Introduction of a Ceiling or Threshold ..........53
4.2 Privacy Issues: Regulation of the Collection, Storage and Use of Genetic Information by Insurers .............................................68
4.2.1 Background ..................................................68
4.2.2 Privacy Amendments: Privacy Amendment (Private Sector) Act 2000 (Cth) ..................71
4.2.3 Review of the Privacy Amendments ..........73
Chapter Five: Findings ........................................75
Chapter Six: Recommendations ........................................77
Appendix 1 ..................................................81
Implications of Genetic Testing for
Australian Insurance Law and
Practice*

Chapter One: Introduction

1.1 About this Report

This paper is in the form of a report prepared on behalf of our research team (Professor Don Chalmers, Professor Loane Skene, Associate Professor Margaret Otlowski and Dr Dianne Nicol)¹ as part of our project, funded by the Australian Research Council, to investigate the legal and ethical implications of the human genome project from an Australian perspective. This report examines the significance of the human genome project for Australian insurance law and practice. A separate report, examining the impact of genetics developments in the area of employment law and practice is also to be published.²

This report follows on from a discussion paper³ that was sent to organisations and individuals having an interest in the area for their comment - our group taking the view that this research should be informed by consultation with the key stakeholders. Those consulted included prominent geneticists and other health care professionals working in the field of genetics, organisations representing people with genetic disabilities, the presiding officers of the Commonwealth, State and Territory Anti-Discrimination Boards and Tribunals, and representatives from the insurance industry. As a result of this targeted consultation process, in excess of twenty-five responses were received, representing a broad cross-section of the individuals and groups that we had approached.

¹ This paper is current as at December 2000.
² We also wish to acknowledge the valuable research assistance from Ms Catherine Hughes. Sincere thanks also to Tristan Taylor and Imogen Goold for their assistance with the formatting and presentation of this report.
³ Implications of Genetic Testing for Australian Employment Law and Practice (Occasional Paper, Centre for Law and Human Genetics, University of Melbourne and University of Tasmania, forthcoming).